



**BEFORE THE STATE COMMISSION
ON JUDICIAL CONDUCT**

CJC Nos. 21-0483, 21-0802 & 21-1609

PUBLIC WARNING

**HONORABLE BONNIE RANGEL
171ST DISTRICT COURT
EL PASO, EL PASO COUNTY, TEXAS**

During its meeting on August 9-11, 2022, the State Commission on Judicial Conduct concluded a review of the allegations against the Honorable Bonnie Rangel, 171st District Court, El Paso, El Paso County, Texas. Judge Rangel was advised by letter of the Commission's concerns and appeared before the Commission on August 11, 2022 and gave testimony.

After considering the evidence before it, the Commission enters the following Findings and Conclusion:

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. At all relevant times, the Honorable Bonnie Rangel was judge of the 171st District Court, El Paso, El Paso County, Texas.
CJC No. 21-0483
2. On October 9, 2020, Judge Rangel presided over a hearing via Zoom in *State of Texas v. Erica Gomez* (the "Gomez Case")¹ on the defense's motion to dismiss for prosecutorial misconduct. The hearing was livestreamed over YouTube and continues to be viewable on YouTube.²
3. During the hearing, Assistant District Attorney ("ADA") Alyssa Nava with the El Paso County District Attorney's office (the "El Paso DAO") was discussing the release of the

¹ Case No. 20180D02515

² YouTube Link: <https://youtu.be/11Yc5otb-kU>.

victim's body by the medical examiner to the defendant's family when Judge Rangel became angry with ADA Nava and the El Paso DAO and began to yell at ADA Nava.

4. Judge Rangel continued to make comments about ADA Nava and the El Paso DAO and yelled at ADA Nava for approximately 20 minutes during the hearing.
5. On September 29, 2020, Judge Rangel presided over a hearing via Zoom in *Estrada, et al. v. Sohail Al-Nairab, d/b/a IHOP Restaurant* (the "Estrada Case")³ on the plaintiff's motion to compel discovery. The hearing was livestreamed on YouTube and continues to be viewable on YouTube.⁴
6. During the hearing, Christine Osterberg, plaintiff's attorney, described her previous meetings to confer with the defense attorneys, Laura Slay and Amada Salter, and their use of the terms "vague and nonsensical" in response to the interrogatories.
7. Judge Rangel began yelling at Ms. Slay and Ms. Salter because she felt they were being disrespectful to Ms. Osterberg because she is a "baby attorney" and they were bullying her.
8. Judge Rangel continued to yell at Ms. Slay and Ms. Salter for using the term "nonsensical" in response to the plaintiff's interrogatories, stating that the use of the term was mean, rude, and disrespectful.

CJC No. 21-0802

9. On October 7, 2021, Judge Rangel presided over a settlement conference hearing via Zoom in *State of Texas v. Raul Gavaldon-Aldaco* (the "Gavaldon-Aldaco Case")⁵. The hearing was livestreamed on YouTube and continues to be viewable on YouTube.⁶
10. During the hearing, Judge Rangel commented on Mr. Gavaldon-Aldaco's medical issues concerning his groin area and stating, "sometimes karma is a bitch" and "if he did it, ... he's suffering right now because God hit him right in the place it all started."

CJC No. 21-1609

11. On August 6, 2021, Judge Rangel presided over a morning hearing docket via Zoom. The hearing was livestreamed on YouTube and continues to be viewable on YouTube.⁷
12. During a hearing with a Spanish-speaking defendant, the public defender stated to Judge Rangel that the defendant could speak some English. In response, Judge Rangel instructed the court interpreter to turn off the Zoom Interpreter Feature.
13. The court interpreter advised Judge Rangel that she was unable to turn the interpreter feature off because she was not an administrator of the Zoom meeting.
14. In response, Judge Rangel advised that another court interpreter was previously able to turn the feature off, and that she should ask him how to turn the Zoom Interpreter Feature off for future reference.

³ Case No. 2020DCV1109.

⁴ YouTube Link: https://youtu.be/_hvzgS9L2bc.

⁵ Case. No. 20140D00326.

⁶ YouTube Link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?app=desktop&v=XFn0FpotMSI&feature=youtu.be>.

⁷ YouTube Link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=esYQxeYT7ws&list=PPSV>.

15. After several exchanges between the court interpreter and the judge regarding turning off the Zoom Interpreter Feature, Judge Rangel began yelling at the court interpreter, stating she was “pissed off with her attitude” and “Goodbye! Have a good life!”

RELEVANT STANDARDS AND AUTHORITIES

1. Canon 3B(4) of the Texas Code of Judicial Conduct states, in relevant part: “A judge shall be patient, dignified and courteous to litigants, jurors, witnesses, lawyers and others with whom the judge deals in an official capacity, ...”

CONCLUSION

Based upon the record before it and the factual findings recited above, the State Commission on Judicial Conduct has determined that the Honorable Bonnie Rangel, 171st District Court, El Paso, El Paso County, Texas, should be publicly warned for failing to patient, dignified and courteous toward the Assistant District Attorney, attorneys and court personnel, all of whom she deals in an official capacity, during court hearings, in violation of Canon 3B(4) of the Texas Code of Judicial Conduct.

The Commission has taken this action pursuant to the authority conferred it in Article V, §1-a(8) of the Texas Constitution in a continuing effort to promote confidence in and high standards for the judiciary.

Issued this the 22 day of August, 2022.



David Schenck
Chairman, State Commission on Judicial Conduct